

**THE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
OF THE YOUNGSTOWN CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT
YOUNGSTOWN, OHIO**

20 West Wood Street

December 20, 2016

The Youngstown Board of Education met in a special session at the I.L. Ward Building on December 20, 2016. The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. by the Board president Ms. Kimble. The meeting opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

ROLL CALL

Shadd, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Adair

Absent for roll call: Sanderson, Williams

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Adair to approve the agenda for September 20, 2016.

Roll call for the vote:

Ayes: Shadd, Kimble, Murphy, Adair

Nays:

Abstain: Hunter

Motion approved.

TAX ABATEMENTS

Ms. Adair said she felt that no tax abatements should be approved and that the abatements were corporate welfare; Mr. Hunter agreed. Ms. Adair stated that Youngstown was one of the poorest cities in the country but tax payers with a median income of around \$24,000 and who are home owners still have to pay their 100% of taxes.

Mr. Hunter also said ultimately, if you are genuinely interested in the best interest of this district you will pay taxes into the district that will help provide for the education of the children. There should be no loopholes and he is not interested in giving any abatement that takes away dollars from the children.

Mr. Murphy disagreed. He said he felt development was good for the city and in the last year and the previous year the Mayor and everyone have worked hard to get new development in the city and he was willing to give a 75% tax abatement. He said it was worth it for our city to survive.

Mr. Shadd commented that it is a shame that we have to be in a situation to figure out how to boost the economy of our city while making sure our students have what they need to stay in school. Mr. Shadd said that the board prior to this year had put in a lot of effort to have a budget that would sustain the district for some time. He went on to say that giving the 75% to hopefully help our families gain jobs through these endeavors is a positive. He also said if the city is willing to take the loss we have to do something to help those efforts to sustain the city.

Ms. Adair responded to Mr. Murphy and Mr. Shadd by stating she had not seen any promises being fulfilled by new developers that constitute a growth of employment in the city, especially among African Americans. She likened some new developers to carpet baggers. She said of course the city is all for the abatement because the city relies on income tax not real estate tax like school districts.

Mr. Hunter said he shared Ms. Adair's concern. Mr. Hunter responded to Mr. Shadd statement by saying he applauded him for considering the budget but they needed to look at what this tax abatement represents. We are spending an abundance of money, we have duplicative services - people doing the same job and now an abatement to further decrease the dollars in the budget. Mr. Hunter said they were at a critical juncture as a board and all they have left is their voice which should be used to cry out against the many forces seeking to take advantage of our city and our children.

Mr. Murphy said he still is going to disagree with Mr. Hunter. He said this was a home town boy coming home and there would be 237 jobs. He went on to say the 75% was a good deal, they could not stop it anyway and he was for the abatement.

Ms. Kimble said we can either let this town dry up or vote for these abatements because it did not matter since it was 75% and the city was going to do it anyway. Ms. Kimble stated she was happy to vote the 75% because the city needs the jobs. She said she did not agree with the 100% abatements but was in favor of the 75% because we need jobs, stating we can educate students and they stay here or educate them and they leave.

Ms. Adair, Mr. Hunter, Mr. Shadd and Ms. Kimble expressed their concern about the budget, where we are and where we are going. Ms. Adair said when you have three to four tax abatements at the same time it seems that nobody wants to pay the cost.

Motioned by Murphy and seconded by Kimble to accept the abatement for MJJ Development, 75% for 15 years.

Roll call for vote:

Ayes: Shadd, Murphy, Kimble

Nays: Adair, Hunter

Motion passed.

Motioned by Murphy and seconded by Kimble to accept the abatement for Hallmark Student Housing, 100% for 15 years.

During discussion Ms. Adair questioned if 100% was automatic when housing was involved. Mr. Shadd thought it was automatic. Ms. Adair expressed additional concern about the housing abatement and Mr. Hunter said he thought he understood what Ms. Adair was trying to convey and stated that the company was building apartments for students who are attending school and they still did not want to pay any taxes. He said that it was absurd and he could not think of any way that he would vote yes for this abatement. Ms. Kimble also thought it was a shame that the company would send this abatement with all the money they are going to make with the housing. Mr. Shadd said he wished that we owned a supermarket to let students shop since there was nothing they could do. Mr. Murphy was not in agreement with the 100% abatement.

Roll call for vote:

Ayes: Shadd

Nays: Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Adair

Motion failed.

Motioned by Murphy and seconded by Adair to accept the abatement for Fireline, 75% for 10 years. Fireline is an existing company going for an expansion.

Ms. Adair said she drives down Andrews avenue all the time and does not see any person of color going in or out of those buildings. She said Mr. Williams had suggested that there be guidelines for hiring when a developer receives tax abatement. Mr. Hunter said tax abatements are addictive and the request for abatement from an established company is on the backs of our children. Mr. Murphy said this was another good abatement for jobs. They would have 10 new jobs in the first year, 13 in the second year and 21 in the third year. Mr. Shadd said he is in support of bringing jobs to the city.

Roll call for vote:

Ayes: Shadd, Kimble, Murphy

Nays: Adair, Hunter

Motion passed.

REORGANIZATIONAL MEETING

Ms. Adair was asking about the reorganization meeting, for what and to do what? Mr. Murphy said to elect a president and a vice president. Ms. Kimble added to act as an advisory board. Mr. Hunter said we are required to do this by policy, but he stated that the question she asked will take a broader discussion to determine what they as a board are going to do to deal with the new

set of realities that has only left them with their voice. Ms. Kimble said they were the eyes and ears of the community and they could not let HB70 or law stop them from doing that job.

Motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Kimble that January 10, 2017, at 5:30 pm be designated for the record as the reorganizational meeting for the Youngstown City School District board of education.

Roll call for vote:

Ayes: Shadd, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Adair
Nays:

Motion passed.

BOARD RESOLUTION OF RECOGNITION

Ms. Kimble wanted to create a resolution of recognition for Phillip Tharpe who helped the teacher at Taft when she was being robbed. Mr. Hunter asked if he had been recognized by any other body like the city; Ms. Kimble replied not that she knew about.

Motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Mr. Hunter that the board by virtue of resolution recognize Phillip Tharpe for his act of heroism in coming to the rescue of one of our teachers.

Roll call for vote:

Ayes: Shadd, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Adair
Nays:

Motion passed.

OSBA TRAINING

Ms. Kimble thought the last training was good and said she would like to see the training continue and asked the board members if they had anything special they would like for training. Ms. Adair said she would like to see them move forward with a mission statement as suggested by the OSBA presenter.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Motioned by Mr. Hunter and seconded by Ms. Adair to enter into executive session for the purpose of appointment, employment dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion, or compensation of an employee or the investigation of charges or complaints against an employee or employees. Also, matters required to be kept confidential by federal law or rules or state statutes.

Roll call for the vote:

Ayes: Shadd, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Adair

Nays:

Motion passed.

Ms. Sanderson entered the meeting during executive session.

After the conclusion of executive session the meeting was adjourned by a unanimous verbal vote of all in favor.

Board President

Treasurer